



THE COMMITTEE TO PRESERVE THE UPPER WEST SIDE

**Testimony of LANDMARK WEST!
Certificate of Appropriateness Committee
Before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
2211 Broadway – The Apthorp Apartments
December 8, 2020**

LANDMARK WEST! is a not-for-profit community organization committed to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the Upper West Side.

The Certificate of Appropriateness Committee wishes to comment on 2211 Broadway, the individually landmarked Apthorp Apartments. This landmark is an Italian Renaissance Revival style apartment building designed by Clinton & Russell and built in 1906-08. The Application is to remove cast iron valuet covers at an areaway and reconstruct stairs.

The Landmark West Certificate of Appropriateness Committee recognizes after multiple attempts that the Commission strongly believes vault lights to be a SoHo hallmark, but not a design feature of the Upper West Side. Yet, for the two or three of these that come before us every year our Committee repeats that the more they are approved for removal, the further that stance about them not being a design feature of the neighborhood rings true.

While within the West End-Collegiate Historic District Extension, the Apthorp is also an individual landmark, and must be scrutinized at a higher level. The vault lights have been poorly maintained, so the reward is removal? While these may be beyond repair, replacement in kind rather than a dry moat would be more in keeping with the intent, but not necessarily as expected. Rather than providing light to those below the sidewalk, imagine the diffuse uplighting from this setback for pedestrians passing by in the evening. While perhaps an unintended benefit, lighting landmarks has become a niche trade, why not follow the original architect's lead?

As to the bench, we can support its removal if it can be removed and infilled in kind without further damage to the original fabric.

The Landmark West Certificate of Appropriateness Committee supports approval of this application with modifications.

Thank You.